

CITIZEN'S TRANSPORTATION OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE

Arizona Department of Transportation

Draft - Minutes

January 22, 2008

A Citizen's Transportation Oversight Committee (CTOC) meeting was held at the City of Surprise Council Chambers, 12425 West Bell Road, Bldg. D-100, Surprise, Arizona 85374 on January 22, 2008, with Jack Lunsford Member at Large presiding.

Members Present:

Jack Lunsford, Member at Large
Jeffrey Schwartz, Maricopa County District 2
Nelson Ladd, Maricopa County District 3
Leyton Woolf, Maricopa County District 4
Peggy Jones, Maricopa County District 5

Members Absent:

Roc Arnett, Chairman
Terry Rainey, Maricopa County District 1

Others Present:

Mayor Lyn Truitt, City of Surprise
Floyd Roehrich, ADOT
Tim Tait, ADOT
Marvin Brown, Citizen
Rosemary Burdi, Citizen
Nancy Swier, Citizen
Barbara B. Harrison, Citizen
Gil Cronk, Citizen
Gloria Hudson, Citizen
William Blue Crowley, Citizen
Doris Anderson, ADOT
Fred Garcia, ADOT
Adrienne Weinkamer, A. G. Office
Lawrence Godin, Citizen
Liz Schacht, Citizen
Bob Phegley, Citizen
Ron Wambach, Citizen
Bill Clavey, Citizen
Bob Ridley, Citizen
Jim Jones, Citizen
Lee Mattke, Citizen
Cheryl Scott, Citizen
Rae Updegraff, Citizen
Diane Hamilton, Citizen
Dave Cesadei, SCW Independent

Walt Maas, Citizen
Tom Citble, Citizen
Melissa Lehan, City of Surprise
Chuck Ullman, Citizen
Tony Burdi, Citizen
Bill Hayden, ADOT
Leon A Swier, Citizen
Paul Hudson, Citizen
Edward J. Johnson, Citizen
Kwi Kang, ADOT
Elizabeth Neville, ADOT
Bill Jameson, A. G. Office
Dale Buskirk, ADOT
Diana Lowery, Citizen
Bob Schacht, Citizen
Mary Holm, Citizen
Jeanne Clavey, Citizen
Norman Biale, Citizen
Bonnie Ridley, Citizen
Jean Jones, Citizen
JV Mattke, Citizen
Gerald Peterson, Citizen
Gene Updegraff, Citizen
Cathy Livingston, Citizen
Terry DeWitte, Citizen

Bob Carlson, Citizen
Clyde Masters, Citizen
Jim Evers, Citizen
Grace Taylor, Citizen
Ron Brown, Citizen
Geo Burroughs, Citizen
Arnold Blogner, Citizen
Joseph B. Ryan, Citizen
Allen Shaw, Citizen
Dwayne Dallmann, Citizen
Ralph M. Arano, Citizen
Randy Overmyer, City of Surprise

Gail Carlson, Citizen
Mary Masters, Citizen
Vickie Evers, Citizen
Ruth Wegner, Citizen
James Koehler, Citizen
Art Toeniskoetter, Citizen
LaVeta Watson, Citizen
Paul Hunter, Citizen
Mae Williams, Citizen
Cynthia Dallmann, Citizen
Jack Rogers, Citizen

1. Call to Order:

Jack Lunsford, Acting Chairman Called to Order the Citizen's Transportation Oversight Committee meeting at 4:00 p.m. He welcomed the public, public officials, members of CTOC and ADOT staff to the meeting.

2. Approval of Minutes:

Jack Lunsford called for a motion to approve the minutes of the November 27, 2007, meeting.

Board Action: Jeff Schwartz moved to approve the November 27, 2007, minutes and the motion was seconded by Nelson Ladd and carried unanimously.

3. Welcome – City of Surprise:

Mayor Lyn Truitt welcomed and thanked the Citizens Transportation Oversight Committee for coming to the City of Surprise to address transportation issues. He stated that transportation is a top priority for the City of Surprise. Since 1990 the population in Surprise has grown from 7,000 and 63 square miles to 105,000 people and 92 square miles. It has been rated as the top city in the nation for job growth. Surprise is the spring training home for the Kansas City Royals and the Texas Rangers. Some of the women's top tennis players competed recently in Surprise. Surprise is a city that continues to grow as does its transportation needs. Again, thank you for coming to the City of Surprise.

Note: Change in agenda order: Agenda Item 5 will be heard before Agenda Item 4.

4. City of Surprise Transportation Issues:

Randy Overmyer, City of Surprise Transportation Planner, gave a PowerPoint presentation and stated that their needs include transit and highway construction. As the region has grown approximately 45 percent each decade since 1960, the growth in vehicles in Maricopa County has almost been as rapid as the growth in population. The region will continue to grow to a projected regional population of more than six million in 2030 and more than seven million in 2040. The projected population for Surprise is 115,000 in 2010 and 400,000 by 2030. Major developments pending were reviewed and include more than 100,000 homes approved but not yet built. Current needs include Bell Road, which has the highest volume of any surface street in the State of Arizona, US 60/Grand Avenue, the gateway to downtown and SR 303, Estrella Freeway. Capacity enhancements were discussed. There is regional money for Phase II for construction on SR 303. STAN money was utilized for capacity improvements. Grand Avenue widening design is underway

between the SR 303 and Loop 101 to be completed in FY 2009. An Enhancement Study to look beyond widening Grand Avenue is underway. The Access Management Study being funded by the City of Surprise and MAG is for Grand Avenue from the SR 303 to SR 74. The MAG I-10 Hassayampa Valley Regional Roadway Framework Study includes improvements and extensions to SR 74, a proposed White Tanks Freeway and a new proposed Hassayampa Freeway in the CANAMEX Corridor through the Town of Buckeye. ADOT has done preliminary work on a controlled access route that is needed to I-17 north of SR 74. MAG is finalizing a Feasibility Study on commuter rail. The adopted roadway plan was shown on a map.

Nelson Ladd, Board Member asked: Where does the funding come from currently?

Mr. Overmyer replied: Funding for local needs comes from a variety of sources including regional partners, the Arizona Department of Transportation, the MAG Regional Transportation Plan, local resources, gas tax, Highway User Revenue Funding, sales tax and Regional Roadway Development Impact Fees.

Peggy Jones, Board Member asked: Can you elaborate on the White Tanks Freeway?

Mr. Overmyer replied: The Hassayampa Valley Framework Study looked at the northwest valley under build-out conditions. That area has a projected population of almost three million people. A map was shown to show the area and ways to connect the communities. SR 74 is north of the White Tanks Freeway and it would extend to the west.

Leyton Woolf, Board Member asked about any possible effects on the city by the Northern Avenue Parkway in Glendale.

Mr. Overmyer replied: That there is a lot of demand across the Aqua Fria River and additional capacity is needed and supported.

Jack Lunsford commented that when the Governor spoke at the State of the State in the West Valley, she talked about the need to have a statewide transportation plan that would go to the people in 2008 or 2009. There was recognition of the needs in Proposition 400, which did not have enough funding in it for anything west of the SR 303. The west valley projects need to be an integral part of any statewide plan.

5. I-10 and I-17 Bypass Studies Update:

Dale Buskirk gave a PowerPoint on the findings of the I-10 Bypass Study and made comments on the I-17 Alternative Study. The State Transportation Board tasked the Department with conducting a study to ascertain the long-range need for and feasibility of a bypass of the Metropolitan Phoenix and Metropolitan Tucson areas. A map of the study area was shown. A Technical Advisory Committee was formed with representatives from MAG, COG and PAG. Since I-10 is an interstate highway that traverses the entire breadth of the country, it was important to have a federal perspective. A mission statement was adopted and reads - to make a preliminary assessment of the need for and feasibility of a new transportation corridor that would provide an alternative to I-10. The purpose is to provide an additional high capacity transportation corridor to accommodate travel across southern and central Arizona. A portion of I-10 serves as a segment of the CANAMEX Corridor which links the countries of Canada, United States and Mexico. The needs include relieve traffic congestion, provide a shorter and faster route, provide an alternative route and serve expected population growth. Social and environmental elements were considered. A number of corridors were identified. For technical reasons, the I-10 was identified as two segments, a western segment and an eastern segment. Currently, with existing facilities, there is an interim bypass of I-10 in place, SR 85 and I-8. As an interstate route, I-8 is a controlled access facility. As the population in the west valley continues to grow, this interim bypass will no longer suffice. The Study was coordinated with the Maricopa Association of Governments Hassayampa Framework Study. Findings included a modest relief of congestion, a shorter, faster route, an alternative route, serving expected growth and it would not traverse sensitive lands. It avoided Tribal lands and protected lands. There was some impact on entitled lands.

Terrain is favorable to road construction. There would be some wildlife crossings in some areas and there is proximity to a National Monument with no encroachment. Regarding the eastern segment, four routes were identified, each with challenges that were primarily environmental. Route locations were described. With routes one, two and three, there was limited relief of congestion, it provided a shorter, faster route of little significance and did not serve western Pinal County. It does traverse extremely sensitive lands with real challenges if a roadway would be built. It avoids Tribal lands and all identified protected lands. There was favorable terrain with one exception. There was strong opposition at public meetings. Route four would have moderate relief, it is a longer route and it would provide a parallel route to I-10 from Tucson to Casa Grande. It serves both Pima and Pinal counties and there are sensitive lands in the area. It avoids Tribal lands and would encroach upon the Tucson Mitigation Corridor. There is some impact to entitled lands; the terrain is favorable and some opposition was encountered. Public meetings were held with good attendance. Numerous comments have been received at meetings, from e-mails and letters. The comments are being incorporated into the study. Key themes enunciated include most cities and towns supported the bypass study, many were concerned about the adverse impact on the environment and wildlife and there was concern that such a facility would significantly change the rural life style. The high cost was discussed for the approximately 250 miles. The report is being finalized and will be presented to the State Transportation Board.

The I-17 Alternative Study has identified several alternatives and technical analysis has been conducted. The Governor has ordered the Department to prepare a Statewide Transportation Plan in the context of frameworks. Critical needs are being identified. The I-17 Alternative Study is being discontinued. A Technical Memorandum is being prepared and will be incorporated within the Northern Framework Study. The study will be conducted but within a different context.

Peggy Jones asked a question about information in the handout from Mr. Buskirk.

Mr. Buskirk stated that information cannot be released until the final report is prepared and presented to the State Transportation Board. ADOT website does have some of the working papers prepared as part of the Study along with a draft report.

Nelson Ladd asked about timeframes?

Mr. Buskirk replied that traffic forecasts have been developed and the best estimate is that this facility would be needed somewhere around 2045 or 2050.

Jack Lunsford asked if there are any cost benefit analyses that can be delivered.

Mr. Buskirk replied that this is a preliminary assessment. Additional study would be required including cost benefit.

Jack Lunsford asked what the basis was to determine modest congestion relief.

Mr. Buskirk replied that there is a measurement of the service provided by a facility called the level of service which ranges from A to F.

6. Loop 303 Noise Issue:

Walt Maas, Resident of Sun City West, gave a PowerPoint presentation and spoke on behalf of Sun City residents affected by the noise of the freeway and asked CTOC for assistance. Sun City West is a community of approximately 30,000 residents in the northwest valley. A map of the area was shown and described. The noise area was identified. They asked ADOT to look at the situation. May 2007 ADOT did a noise study and no action was recommended. Residents disputed the study and are asking CTOC to have the conclusions reconsidered. The dispute with the study is not with technical analysis but with conclusions reached. There are policy and management decisions that need addressed including improper use of decibel

readings. The federal policy was violated in that the values were applied in a way that was not intended and using only those values to form the conclusions. ADOT is claiming that Loop 303 is noise mitigated. All evidence shows that this is not the case. The link from Loop 303 to I-17 was ignored. Plans are in motion for a link to I-17 scheduled to start this year and complete in 2010. Upon completion, there will be an interchange at I-17 with local traffic increases and a complete link from I-17 to I-10. ADOT has been asked to consider this in their deliberations. They have declined. They have not included it in the Environmental Assessment Report. Needs include full mitigation as part of the phase one link to I-17, perhaps with a wall and rubberizing. It was asked that CTOC recommend to ADOT that consideration of Sun City West noise abatement include a realistic, upcoming traffic model, that additional decision criteria other than past decibel readings and support the use of Proposition 400 funds. Mr. Maas asked the CTOC committee what can be done now to help relieve the situation.

Jack Lunsford, Acting Chairman articulated that it is not on the agenda for an action item; therefore, action cannot be taken. CTOC may not meet again prior to the MAG's/CTOC Joint Public meeting scheduled.

Mr. Hayden, ADOT stated that the funding for mitigation to eleven sites identified by respective cities in the MAG region is under consideration. The preliminary study provided for a review of those criteria utilized in each of the eleven locations as to whether or not they are eligible for noise mitigation measures above and beyond the noise mitigation measures planned with the construction of the freeway. A second and final study will be underway and a recommendation to MAG and ADOT will be made as to the prioritization of the funds.

Mr. Maas stated he asked earlier that this item be addressed today and asked what do we have to do to get action?

Mr. Lunsford replied: we can ask the item to be revisited by ADOT. We cannot take action but we can ask staff to review it and report back to us.

Nelson Ladd, Board Member recommended the Board includes this as an action item at our next regular meeting.

Jeffrey Schwartz, Board Member and Mr. Lunsford Acting Chairman concurred.

Peggy Jones, Board Member asked about the funding and prioritization based on the noise study.

Mr. Hayden said yes, the intent of the plan is to finalize the noise study and make recommendations in which the funding for mitigation will be prioritized and ultimately approved by both MAG and ADOT.

7. Regional Freeway Status Report:

Bill Hayden summarized the annual ADOT preparation of the Five-Year Construction Program for 2009-2013 and provided a brief update on major projects underway or soon to be under construction for this calendar/fiscal year. A handout was given and described as a draft document and the vehicle by which ADOT and MAG will review and approve projects specifically in the MAG region. A larger statewide five year program also is in draft form. Projects discussed in the MAG region are funded by the Regional Area Road Funds. In the next three months, ADOT, MAG, CTOC, RPTA, Phoenix Transit, Valley Metro Rail and the State Transportation Board will have an opportunity to preview this draft program for the next five years and include public hearings held around the State. The draft five year program is an annual update by staff to provide decision makers prioritization of funding and schedule. Proposed changes in funding were highlighted in red and will be presented in detail in the public hearings.

Jack Lunsford asked if Mr. Hayden is aware of how the ADOT's five year plan is being considered in context with the development of a statewide plan.

Mr. Hayden replied that ADOT is aware and as the statewide transportation plan proceeds with all the framework studies which are currently underway. ADOT will provide much of the technical data.

In reply to a question about integration:

Mr. Hayden stated that ADOT's experience in statewide planning is a major determinant of whether or not that can be processed in the decision making process. ADOT has participated in numerous large studies. Mr. Hayden believes that ADOT can participate in that process and will be included.

Mr. Hayden continued with the second part of his presentation regarding a brief update on major projects underway or soon to be underway. A graphic was shown that represents the Regional Transportation Plan which is ADOT/MAG's twenty year plan approved by the voters of Maricopa County in 2004. The purpose of the public voting was to approve the extension of the half cent sales tax as a primary economic engine for the development of the Regional Transportation Plan. In 1985, the first portion of the Regional Transportation Plan consisted of about 137 miles of new freeways to be built in and around the Phoenix Metropolitan area. ADOT, MAG and other transportation committees made presentations to the public indicating that the program needed to be enlarged and improved. Voters agreed to extend the half cent sales tax for twenty more years. In the five year program, \$3.56 billion will be spent for transportation in the Maricopa County region. Major projects were highlighted and include a five mile section of the Red Mountain Freeway from Power Road to University Drive constituting the completion of the Regional Freeway System. Beginning on I-10 from Loop 101 to Sarival Road, a six mile section of roadway will add general purpose lanes and HOV lanes in two phases. A series of projects add general purpose lanes and HOV lanes on I-17 from Loop 101 proceeding north to the Carefree Highway. A project from Carefree Highway or SR 74 proceeding north to Anthem will improve access and capacity on I-17. A major project is the South Mountain Freeway connecting to I-10 at approximately 55th Avenue to proceed south and east. The SR 801 will connect to the future South Mountain Freeway and proceed west connecting to the SR 303 and ultimately to SR 85. Another project is improvements to I-10 from Baseline Road south of US 60 and proceeding around the Broadway curve to SR 51. A design build project on the Red Mountain Freeway from Loop 101 in Tempe proceeding west to the SR 51. Programs presented are draft only and indicate where the transportation priorities are in the valley, funding sources and prioritization.

In reply to a question about the I-10 reliever project, Mr. Hayden stated that it is not programmed yet. It is in the study phase.

8. Call to the Public:

Chuck Ullman, resident speaking on behalf of Sun City West PORA, discussed public meetings held by ADOT one year ago. The ADOT report regarding the Loop 303 noise issue was read in part. Mr. Ullman asked CTOC to help the acceleration of the Loop 303 sound mitigation sound wall project in order for residents to return to a peaceful and healthy retirement.

Paul Hunter, resident of Sun City West, stated that his home is near the sound wall. When the home was built in 1996, we were assured that this road would be in a different position. As we well know, buyer beware; things do happen. In listening to previous presentations of the planning and increase of truck and automotive traffic that this community is facing, it is putting more pressure on Loop 303 and residents being confronted with noise and pollution. I live in the site line; I see the tops of the trucks; I hear the motorcycles, particularly at certain times of the day that are really disturbing. I encourage you to understand what the future is before us and what we as residents are facing with this noise and pollution level and hopefully ADOT will consider us with funds to do the wall and rubberized asphalt.

Jack Rogers, resident of Sun City West, said that he is affected by the noise that Loop 303 has created. The noise is significant. I talked to a number of neighbors and there is a general consensus that the noise

decibel reading that is created by that highway and collected by the State doesn't really reflect noise levels at any given time. Atmospheric conditions affect the amount of noise. I urge and hope the Board will step up to get something done about noise mitigation.

Jim Evers, resident of Sun City West, stated that the Department of Transportation suggested putting a water feature in your yard. I put one in front of my house, one behind my house and one in my house. Before I came here today, I thought there was a motorcycle coming through my house. My dog barks continuously because of these noises. It is hard to sleep.

Arnold Bloomer, resident of Sun City West, stated that the decibel readings do not adjust for most of the trucks and the highs of the motorcycles because they are a sudden impact. This is most effective between four and eight in the morning and afternoon during the commute hours and the late evening when most of the trucks are running between ten and two or three. I hope you will consider improving this situation.

Marvin Brown, resident of Sun City West, said that he has been in contact with ADOT by phone and has written a letter regarding the decibels in the area. I am about 200 yards from that freeway and it is so noisy that it is deafening. I told my contact come out here at 6 am with his machine and we'll get a committee together to watch. He never answered. I gave up. We have been doing this for three years. The noise is getting worse. Between 4-6 am is the worse. Motorcycles, trucks and anything you can think of are going down that highway. They built walls when Loop 101 went in, almost down to Scottsdale. Anytime they go that way, a wall goes up fast. Out in our area, a wall never goes up.

Joseph Ryan, resident of Sun City West, stated that he has been after people in Arizona for 15 years and in certain situations there were noise situations involved. I went to Washington and appointees are making decisions more on policy than on fact. There is a possibility that the folks by the wall near Loop 303 are not getting what they want in terms of replies based on policy not fact. That says that we should have a new director of ADOT because the people under the director want their paychecks and so if they do not follow the marching orders you are not going to get any answers unless you change the head of ADOT. The problem is major and it may get worse. The last time I saw the plans for the interchange of Grand Avenue and Loop 303, they did not have high speed interchange ramps. One map I saw had a traffic light 25 feet under Grand Avenue and if trucks are coming down and are going to make a left turn and hit a traffic light 25 feet under Grand Avenue, they are going to use their Jake brakes. Not only are you going to have a tremendous volume of trucks but I listened to that engineer speak to MAG for 45 minutes, there is no lift to I-10 either; it's a narrow road with traffic lights. The planners don't know what they are talking about. There are no standards for planning. There are no policies and procedures for planning. As long as you get people who don't know how to plan, the folks by the wall are in deep trouble. You have to go back and look at how these people come to these decisions.

Joseph Ryan, also spoke on behalf of resident Mae Williams, she had an article printed in the *Arizona Republic* a long time ago and it says that there is going to be mature trees planted by Maricopa County Department of Transportation and they had \$50,000 to do this. The trees are going to be between Loop 303 and where they live. There are no sign of them. She would like to ask somebody at MCDOT what happened to the \$50,000 and where are the trees and when are they going to be planted. The Recreation Center at Sun City West said they would take care of watering the trees. This gets back to promising something and not doing any thing. I jumped on the head of ADOT and now let me suggest some things to you folks. There are about 4 million people in your region and they have lots of wonderful ideas. They know where the problems are and they know how to fix them. Most of the meetings I've been to have two or three citizens out of 4 million. If you check your job description, it is full of things you can do, action items, recommendations. If you don't have an action item on the agenda, you can't do anything. I suggest you take care of the 4 million people. You have meetings once a month and you plan them so everybody can get to them. They did this back east and they sometimes had meetings until midnight because people wanted to tell their problems. Every item on your agenda should be an action item. It is not fair when a government employee, consultant or expert gives propaganda..... It's going to be three months before you meet again and to take action because you can't take action outside this meeting.

Joseph Ryan commented on his last item stating that several years ago, I saw one of the studies on Grand Avenue and he was an expert on commuter rail. He told MAG that the answer to everyone's problems was three trains in the morning and three trains in the evening. That mimics the express bus schedule. You have 23 groups going to government offices and in the evening they go back. This goes back to one of the things I saw in the toll road study between Tucson and Phoenix, no mention was made of safety, costs, or convenience. I have been in the transportation business and the number one thing is safety, number two should be convenience and three is cost. When these experts do the study the first thing they want to know about is convenience, safety then cost. In all the studies, they only talk about what we see today on the ground. You're talking about the wildlife. If something is elevated, the moose and caribou can walk under it and not affect it. If something is elevated, there are no grade level crossings. When you have convenient things going along Grand Avenue, railroad tracks you get hundreds of thousands of people stopping and waiting for the train. I have never seen in any of these studies, the cost of people waiting. When you see the cost of putting in light rail or any of these things, when you rip up asphalt, the highways that are there you're taking off the balance sheet because it's destroyed and that's a cost. Those and many other costs were never considered and when they talk about these wonderful things I think the auditors and attorney general should file suit under the Rico Act. Mr. Ryan provided eight pages of typed comments to CTOC members.

William Crowley, citizen stated and that while on the Wickenburg connector, a young lady asked if there were any synagogues in Sun City or Sun City West and how to get to them. I tried to make this happen. In a letter I received they said there are no transfer points between the two buses involved. In Sun City West it runs along Grand Avenue. I'm getting tired of the systems not working together. There was a question presented to Bill Hayden awhile back of the Chairman and his voting at MAG. Has that question ever been answered and if not, why not? Because your position is such that you have influence and I was asking that as a direct question and I would like an answer. Two meetings ago you were told to get that information. Last meeting you didn't have it. Did you give them that today? The public would like to know what the opinion is of the Attorney General's office on Mr. Arnett's behavior at MAG.

Jack Lunsford asked, do you recall if there was a request to counsel to answer that question?

Mr. Crowley stated that Mr. Ladd said in fact why don't you have it for us at the last meeting. If you didn't have it at the last meeting, where is it now? What is the chairman's position at MAG. is he voting for himself or for the Board?

Mr. Lunsford stated that we will ask counsel again to advise us on that.

William Crowley continued by stating that you will notice how many people aren't here. The reason is that we aren't putting the word out effectively.

Jack Lunsford explained that the room was packed and the fire marshal had to ask people to move to the lobby.

William Crowley stated that he was glad to see a representative from District 5 is finally here. Hope from now on that you will be more citizen sensitive and that it isn't just roads and freeways that you are doing. It's the buses and also the Wickenburg connector. They changed the Wickenburg connector schedule and five people aren't going to be able to get to work because one person went to a meeting and said here is what I'd like and instead of expanding it, they changed it. When a lady can't get to Synagogue and it takes three weeks for the two systems to communicate - that's not the way it's supposed to run. If you have a Wickenburg connector, the buses should be able to connect.

Jack Lunsford thanked all the citizens for their comments.

Mr. Lunsford also mentioned that Mr. Hayden is retiring and expressed gratitude for his service.

Mr. Hayden said that he is ending his 38 ½ year tenure with ADOT and 40 years of serving the state. He expressed appreciation for the friendships that have made his experience worthwhile.

9. Next Scheduled Meeting:

Joint Public Hearing – Tentative
Friday, March 2008
Maricopa Association of Governments

10. Adjournment:

The meeting adjourned at 6:15 p.m.